	1	EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING
Wilson	2	FRIDAY, OCTOBER 12, 1990
Wilson 10-12-90	3	U.S. Senate
47 pp.	4	Committee on Finance
	5	Washington, D.C.
	6	The hearing was convened, pursuant to notice, at 11:14
	7	p.m., the Hon. Lloyd Bentsen (Chairman) presiding.
	8	Also present: Senators Moynihan, Baucus, Boren, Bradley,
	9	Mitchell, Pryor, Riegle, Rockefeller, Daschle, Breaux,
	10	Packwood, Dole, Roth, Danforth, Chafee, Heinz, Durenberger,
	11	Armstrong and Symms.
	12	Also present: Vanda McMurtry, Staff Director and Chief
	13	Counsel; Edmond Mihalski, Chief of Staff, Minority.
	14	Also present: Dr. Gail Wilenski, Director, Health Care
	15	Financing Administration.
	16	Also present: Sam Sessions, Chief Tax Counsel; Bob Kyle,
	17	Chief Trade Counsel; Dr. Marina Weiss, Chief Analyst; Joseph
	18	Humphreys, Margaret Malone, Shannon Salmon, Professional Staff
	19	Members; Lindy Paull, Deputy Chief of Staff, Minority.
	20	(The press release announcing the hearing follows:)
	21	
-	22	
	23	
	24	
	25	
		MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223
		MOLLII VELOVIING VODOCIVIES (201) 220-2222

1The Chairman. The Committee will come to order. If you2will please be seated and cease conversation.

When this process started, as Chairman of the Committee, I 3 set about to put together a proposal on taxes that would break 4 the bubble, would go to 33 percent, and in turn I took out of 5 the budget that the President submitted at the beginning of 6 the year his provision for a capital gains cut -- chapter and 7 verse; period and semicolon -- because I thought that that was 8 what he wanted. And in turn breaking the bubble at 33 percent 9 10 would see that in cutting this deficit that those with the highest income bore a fair share of that burden. 11

12 It became apparent that he changed his mind on that, 13 insofar as the capital gains version submitted in the budget 14 and that obviously was not going to work. There is no way we 15 can get a provision out of this Committee that is major and 16 controversial without it being a bi-partisan approach.

But the one thing that I was determined was that we would 17 not see the top six-tenths of 1 percent of the people not 18 bearing a fair share of that burden. That the average family 19 middle income people would not be bearing the biggest part of 20 And with that goal in mind I went to work with Senator 21 it. Mitchell, Senator Packwood and Senator Dole as representing 22 the Republicans on the Committee to develop a bi-partisan 23 alternative that did not break that bubble, but carried 24 through the thought that the burden of cutting this deficit 25

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

was shared by all of those who could afford to share it. 1 We put in extraordinary hours and Senator Packwood and 2 Senator Dole shared that, and Senator Mitchell. And what we 3 have brought you tonight is the result of those discussions 4 that requires a substantial contribution by those with the 5 highest income. With those of income over \$200,000 a year, 6 their contribution will be substantially larger than in the 7 Budget Summit. And the burden on the vast majority of average 8 American families will be substantially reduced. 9

We made other changes. We reduced the burden on Medicare 10 beneficiaries by some \$10 billion. We eliminated the 2 cent a 11 gallon surcharge on petroleum -- and to my friends in the 12 northeast, we took out heating oil. We reduced the gasoline 13 tax from what was proposed in the Senate. We deleted the two-14 week delay in paying laid off workers in receiving their 15 unemployment compensation. Those were some of the details and 16 we will get into the rest of them as we go along. 17

Let me talk for just a moment about what this nation has been going through. Last weekend we saw the Government shut down because we were arguing and could not resolve our differences. The American people were duly upset by that. This Finance Committee in resolving this problem shares by far the largest part of bringing it about.

The Finance Committee has the responsibility of reducing that deficit by \$195 billion over the next five years. In

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 · LASER BOND

1 making some very tough and often some very politically unpopular decisions, the Committee has a reputation of getting 2 its job done and setting aside partisan differences when it is 3 really needed. I think they have lived up to that reputation Δ in what we are considering tonight in deficit reduction. 5 We have had a staff that has put in extraordinary hours 6 7 and dedication. They have done an excellent job of it. We have extenders that we put in that are time sensitive and have 8 9 broad bi-partisan support. I believe we have done the job. I would like to defer to Senator Packwood for any comment 10 he might have. 11

Senator Packwood. Mr. Chairman, thank you.

13 It is with some trepidation that I support this package, 14 although I do, because my experience in the 22 years I have 15 been here and looking back on history prior to that very, 16 very, very seldom are tax increases used for deficit 17 reduction. They are usually used to support increased 18 spending.

Evidence of that is simple. Thirty-five years ago in this country we taxed 20 percent of the gross national product -all of our governments, Federal, State and local -- taxed 20 percent of it and we spent 22 percent of it. Now we tax about 30 percent of it and we spend about 32 percent. Taxes have gone up rather dramatically. Spending has gone up rather dramatically. And we have not narrowed the deficit.

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

4

But in this bill there is an effort to guarantee, as the bill comes out of the Finance Committee, that the taxes will be used in large measure to reduce the deficit. So as the bill comes out of here, I am willing to support it. And make no doubt about it, there are ample increases in taxes on the rich in this bill.

7 Despite the publicity, I do not think that was ever an 8 issues, except for those who wanted to attempt to maintain 9 that if you opposed increasing the rates on the rich you were 10 opposed to increasing the taxes on the rich. It is amazing 11 how quickly the wheel turns when not five years ago, ten years 12 ago, we were talking about very high tax rates and the scandal 13 was that the rich avoided paying taxes.

14 Maybe some people got a great solace out of a 92 percent 15 tax rate or a 70 percent tax rate or a 50 percent tax rate, 16 but that is all you got in many cases because the rich did not 17 pay taxes. They had tax shelters and deductions. We tried to 18 trim those.

19 The reason I so desperately did not want to go up on the 20 rates -- not the taxes on the rich, but the rates -- is I 21 could see the cycle coming back. Go up on the rates and then 22 add capital gains. And then pretty soon we'd go up on the 23 rates again because it would be alleged that capital gains 24 favored the rich and we would have to raise them once more and 25 then the passive losses would have to come back because people

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 · LASER BOND

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

would not undertake activities we wanted them to undertake
 because the rates were too high.

3 So this bill is an effort to keep the tax rate down while 4 increasing revenues from the rich by limiting deductions and 5 that has been successful.

So I will note this bill out of Committee. And if the 6 rest of the package that comes to us from the Budget Committee 7 is satisfactory, I will vote for the package. 8 But I am withholding my judgment on that because for those who have 9 covered this for the better part of six months, they have 10 11 heard me say time and again that there were three parts to 12 this package -- there is going to be spending restraints, 13 hopefully; and revenues; and enforcement. And enforcement 14 would be far in a way the most difficult part of this package. 15 And not enforcement coming out of this Committee.

If you pass a tax you know what it is. And by in large 16 our enforcements are in the entitlements; and the entitles are 17 And you cannot get any more out of the entitlement than 18 law. the law says you can get. That is the restraint. But we 19 collectively -- Republicans and Democrats, House and Senate, 20 21 liberal and conservative -- have a miserable history of being 22 able to enforce alleged spending restraints.

23 So the bill is not perfect, but it is satisfactory. And 24 if the rest of the Committees do their job we will have a 25 package that genuinely reduces the deficit. Part of it with

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 · LASER BOND

1 taxes, part of it with spending limitations. If we achieve 2 that, it will be the first time in my memory that we have used 3 taxes, including significant increases in taxes on the rich to 4 reduce the deficit.

5 Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

6 The Chairman. Thank you.

7 I would like to call on the Majority Leader for any
8 comment he might want to make.

9 Senator Mitchell. Mr. Chairman, thank you very much for 10 your courtesy in calling upon me; and thank you very much for 11 the outstanding leadership you have displayed in bringing us 12 to this point. I think it fair to say, and I believe I can 13 speak for all of our colleagues, that this would not have been 14 possible without your determined leadership through a very 15 difficult period.

I will support this package because I believe it is a fair 16 compromise. It does not represent my preference. 17 With all due respect to my good friend and colleague, Senator Packwood, 18 19 I believe that the most fair, logical way to raise the necessary revenues would be to increase the maximum marginal 20 21 rate on those whose incomes exceed \$200,000 a year to 33 22 percent. To say that one is a 33 percent rate on those whose 23 incomes exceed \$200,000 a year is not to say that one is for a 24 90 percent rate or a 70 percent rate.

25

My position comes as no surprise to any member of this

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

Committee because, of course, in 1986 I offered an amendment
 to the Tax Reform Act to have a third rate which I felt was
 fair. I believe that would be the fairest and best way to
 accomplish the task we are attempting to accomplish. But we
 cannot do that.

6 The President has indicated he would veto such legislation 7 and with Senator Packwood's determined leadership our 8 Republican colleagues are unified in opposition to it. And, 9 therefore, we have to do what we can to develop an acceptable 10 alternative that is itself fair, although not the first 11 preference of myself and perhaps others here.

12 This package is such an alternative. As Senator Packwood 13 rightly noted by the limitation on itemized deductions and by 14 the increase in the health insurance tax, those whose incomes 15 exceed \$100,000 a year are called upon to pay a fair share of 16 the burden of meeting this serious national problem. The 17 result in terms of fairness is far superior to the Summit 18 Agreement I am pleased to say.

19 The distribution charts which have been or will be made 20 public demonstrate that very clearly. And for that, all of 21 those who participated in the shaping of this agreement 22 deserve great credit.

At each step of this process it has seemed as though we have just climbed Mount Everest and no sooner do we get over the top than we look and see an even higher mountain ahead of

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

I think that is where we are now with the reconciliation 1 us. 2 process confronting us. But with good faith, with a bipartisan approach, and with determination, I believe that we 3 4 can enact meaningful, fair and responsive deficit reduction 5 legislation. This is an important contribution to that effort and I encourage all of my colleagues to support it. 6 Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 7

8 The Chairman. I would like to call on the Minority9 Leader, Senator Dole.

10 Senator Dole. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I thank the 11 Ranking Republican, Senator Packwood, and the Majority Leader. 12 We are getting into the hard part now and that is passing a 13 reconciliation bill. This has been a long torturous process 14 for some of us who have been involved from the first day and I 15 know that some of our efforts have not been fully appreciated 16 by our colleagues.

17 But that is all right if the end result is all right. Ι believe the end result is right and necessary. If we do not 18 face up to our responsibilities when it comes to deficit 19 20 reduction now, as I said on the floor last week, when will we. And if not this group of Senators, which group of Senators. 21 22 We had a majority in the Senate who favored the Budget Summit 23 package. As the Majority Leader has indicated, this is even 24 more finely tuned. It softens some of the sharp edges in the 25 budget package and I am certain we have the votes on the

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 • LASER BOND

Senate floor for this package if, as the Senator from Oregon
 pointed out, Senator Packwood, the other Committees produce
 real savings and we end up with a \$500 billion package.

We have talked a lot about the capital gains and the poor verses the rich. I assume maybe at one point or another there may have been some justification for that. I think if anybody examines this package we are going to pick up about \$30 billion from those over \$100,000 because of the so-called Ps Amendment, which is going to limit deductions.

10 There will be another \$20 billion because we raised the 11 AGHI cap from about \$53,000 to \$89,000, which will touch upper 12 middle income Americans and the Ps provision will touch those 13 with even higher incomes. But I assume some will still make 14 the argument that we should tax the rich more -- whoever the 15 rich are. Nobody in this room. But somebody may walk in 16 later who is rich.

17

(Laughter)

Senator Dole. And then the rest of the taxes are primarily excise taxes -- gasoline, tobacco, wine, beer, distilled spirits. About a third of the package, about \$50 billion, will go to that people from \$53,000 up to over \$100,000 -- about a third of the package. And we will compensate through the EITC and other ways those at the bottom end.

25

So I think all in all, as the distribution tables will

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

11 show -- and I am not certain that the distribution tables are 1 exactly accurate -- but they do show a fair distribution. 2 Ι wanted to thank the Chairman and Senator Packwood and others 3 for their patience. 4 I believe we can go to the floor. One of our colleagues 5 is already over on the floor criticizing the package. 6 7 (Laughter) Senator Dole. I put him down as undecided. 8 9 (Laughter) Senator Dole. But he is going through point by point to 10 say you are raising taxes, raising taxes and not getting any 11 spending reduction. Well I guess that is the way it will end 12 I do not favor taxes, but I think if we are realistic and 13 up. want to address the budget deficit we never could do it 14 15 without revenues. I wanted ten years for growth to get us out of the 16 17 deficit. 18 (Laughter) Senator Dole. I remember the witness who was here before 19 our Committee who had the good news/bad news joke about supply 20 siders. He said the good news -- I quess this is not my 21 quote --22 23 (Laughter) 24 Senator Dole. "The good news is that a bus load of supply siders went over the cliff. The bad news is there were 25 MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 . LASER BOND

1 three empty seats.''

(Laughter)

2

Senator Dole. We debated that a lot over the past decade 3 4 and I think growth is certainly important. Do not misunderstand me. But so is restraint and spending restraint. 5 I agree with my colleagues, if we could do it all through 6 7 spending restraint that would be the ideal. But it is not 8 going to happen. So do we do nothing or do we do the best we can? I believe in this package we have done the best the 9 10 majority of this Committee can do. I believe the Senate and the Senate leadership and those who are part of the Budget 11 12 Summit are going to do the best that we can to uphold the Budget Summit Agreement and the bi-partisanship we had from 13 day one. Without it, we are not going to achieve anything. 14 We will do our part in the Senate. I would hope we will 15 16 have the same luck on the House side. I do believe that the 17 changes for success there are better.

So again, thank you very much, Mr. Chairman. I look forward to voting for this package. Obviously, it is not going to be popular with everyone and there will be some people willing to blame just those in the budget so-called ''Big Eight'' and so it is good to expand the group.

(Laughter)

23

24

25

Senator Dole. Thank you.

The Chairman. Thank you very much, Mr. Minority Leader.

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO.: BAYONNE. N J. 07002 · LASER BOND

Let me say it is now 25 minutes of 12:00 and we still have to go through this bill, walk our way through it. And of the members who are here, as apart from the one who is over speaking against it, if you desire recognition, you can have it.

6 Senator Pryor. Could we vote first and then explain the 7 bill? We have had plenty of explanation.

(Laughter)

8

9

18

The Chairman. Senator Moynihan?

Senator Moynihan. Mr. Chairman, I am one of 15 at least
who will vote to report this bill and, of course, of
acknowledging what you and Senator Packwood have done.

I think I do want to record a concern about the Ps
Amendment. It is a form of double taxation and it produces a
double bubble in that very area we were concerned about. But
you cannot do everything in one bill and what you could do you
have done.

The Chairman. Thank you.

19 Are there others? Senator Roth?

20 Senator Roth. Mr. Chairman, I want to congratulate you 21 and the others for the job you have done. But I have to say 22 that I very strongly disagree with the idea of raising taxes 23 at this particular time. We have a stagnant economy, one with 24 practically no growth, increasing unemployment, and it makes 25 no sense to me to be undertaking one of the largest tax

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 - LASER BOND

1 increases in the history of this country.

Just let me say that as I believe Senator Packwood pointed 2 out, there is no assurance -- no assurance that there is going 3 to be any spending cuts. History has shown, a study has been 4 made, that for every dollar of increased revenue spending 5 increases \$1.58. And what we see on the floor gives us no 6 reason to be encouraged that the situation is going to be 7 Because practically every appropriation or otherwise now. 8 every piece of legislation lays the groundwork for increased 9 10 spending.

Last night an appropriation was adopted that would 11 increase spending by 7 percent. That is not reducing the 12 deficit. That is increasing the deficit. Now I think that it 13 is discouraging that we do not see anything in the package 14 that really provides or helps create incentives for growth, 15 jobs and opportunity. One may laugh at the 1980s, but that 16 was the longest peace time growth with millions of new jobs 17 created. 18

I fear that instead of reducing the deficit, instead of creating the kind of incentives that are necessary for an expanding economy, we are going to be taxing more and more for less and less. My understanding that with the tax proposal that we have before us today that revenue will rise to 20 percent -- over 20 percent, 20.1 percent -- the highest tax rate in the history of this country.

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

Just let me say, I fear that we will be back here next year because there will not be the kind of reductions in spending that there ought to be. I am proud of the fact that I voted against Gramm-Rudman. It seems to me that all it does is to create a crisis; and as a result of crisis each year we raise taxes. I think that is the wrong way to go; and I will vote against the package.

8 The Chairman. Thank you.

Are there others? All right. Thank you.

Yes. Senator Riegle?

9

10

ł

Senator Riegle. Mr. Chairman, I just want to put an issue on the table that I mentioned inside in our other meeting. I want to say at the outset that I will be voting with you to report this package, as I indicated earlier that I would. I am going to reserve how I vote on the Senate floor when the issue comes to the Senate floor.

17 I want to say that I agree with the point that has been made earlier -- I think by George Mitchell -- that this is a 18 fair compromise. That is a very carefully chosen phrase. 19 Ι think it probably is a fair compromise given the polarity of 20 interest. I do not think that is the same thing as saying it 21 is a fair package. I think there are elements of it -- and we 22 would all see it differently; we all have reservations about 23 it -- but I for one am very concerned about the size of the 24 Medicare charges to beneficiaries, even though they are less 25

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

1 | than they were in the Summit.

The reason they are less than they were in the Summit is 2 that they were unconscionably high there and that it was not 3 able to carry when it was put to a vote of a broader 4 I think if this were put to a vote of the country membership. 5 today -- and I do not just mean a vote of elderly people in 6 the country, people who get Medicare; but people of other age 7 groups -- I think you would have an overwhelming vote to 8 reduce further the size of the burden on Medicare 9 beneficiaries. 10

11 This package that we now have in the area of just the Part 12 B deductible increase alone, which would go up to \$150, that 13 will take \$7.7 billion away from that group over five years. 14 Now that group as everybody here in this room knows is the 15 group who constitute the elderly people with health problems 16 and they only pay this if they actually go out and have to 17 require health services.

I do not think that that \$7.7 billion which is just part 18 of what we are asking them to pay -- there is another part in 19 here that will remain -- I do not think they should be asked 20 to carry it. I do not think there is any justification for 21 I realize there are people on this Committee who hold a 22 it. I am expressing my view. I do not think it different view. 23 ought to be in here; and I think that part of the deficit 24 reduction ought to be born by people in a position, in a much 25

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

1 stronger position in our society, to pay those bills.

2 I think the tax increases that are in here are really very 3 modest. When you look at it over the context of what happened 4 during the 1980s and what was done with tax policy in terms of 5 whose load was light in the context of whose load is now being increased to deal with that problem, Senator Dole in a sense 6 7 implies a lack of promised growth out of those tax cuts during the 1980s. 8 So at some point later on down the line it will be 9 my intention to offer an amendment that would eliminate that 10 increase in the Part B deductible to \$150 which is, as I say, 11 amounts to \$7.7 billion out of the elderly with health 12 problems over the next five years.

13 The way I would propose to pay for it, because everything 14 has to have an offset and has to be paid for, and I appreciate and respect that requirement, my present thinking is that the 15 best way to do that would be with a surtax on taxable income 16 17 of individuals earning more than \$1 million a year. In other 18 words, this surtax would not apply to the first \$1 million of 19 taxable income. It would only apply to the amount of income above that level. And according to the tax estimates that we 20 21 have, that figure is roughly \$7.6 billion which is virtually a wash with the Part B premium increase. 22

So one of the questions we are going to have to ask here
-- I mean this is -- I beg your pardon, deductible.

One of the questions we are going to have to ask ourselves

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

17

here is, this is a very important Committee and I feel very 1 2 privileged to serve on this particular Committee, and everybody that is in this room is in a privileged position, if 3 you will, just by virtue of their presence and the role that 4 they play, whether they are out here or out in this end of the 5 There are 240 million Americans out there, a large 6 room. number of them senior citizens, to whom this is, I think, a 7 crucial item. 8

I think they have been under represented, if you will, in 9 the jockeying for positions and tradeoffs because of just the 10 way the leverage sits and the equations that have led up to 11 12 this particular point. That is just the way it is. I realize that the negotiators that would represent my point of view 13 have fought very hard to change this and were not able to do 14 so beyond what we see. But I just want to serve notice now 15 16 that there are those kinds of feelings and in any case, I 17 think the increase in the offset to pay for that reduction in the cost of Medicare beneficiaries is something that is very 18 much in the national interest. 19

I think it is fair. I think it is right. I think if the public would vote on it in a public referendum on November 6th they would vote for it, probably 80 to 20 or even higher than that. So I think there ought to be an opportunity at a later point for that issue to be put out in a broader form so that it can be debated and voted upon.

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

1 I thank the Chair.

2

The Chairman. Thank you.

Gentlemen, we have a long task ahead. Senator?
Senator Danforth. I have but a one-sentence response,
maybe two.

During the five-year period of this budget agreement, in
response to Senator Riegle, Medicare spending will increase
from \$92 billion to \$154 billion under this agreement which is
a 66 percent increase in the cost of Medicare.

10 Senator Baucus. Mr. Chairman?

11 The Chairman. Yes. Senator Baucus?

Senator Baucus. Mr. Chairman, I, along with all of us, commend you, the Majority Leader, and Minority Leader, and Senator Packwood, for the extraordinary work that you have put into this package. I do not know how you did it frankly -all the time and effort that you put into it.

And now each of us faces the inevitable question as to whether this is better for our country or whether it is better for our own States, for our parts of the country. There is always that inherent intention -- you know, the degree to which we as Senators are voting for the national interest, and the degree to which we as Senators are representing our own States and voting our own State and geographic interest.

It is with some reluctance and with some regret that as I look at this package see that although it is more fair than

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

lages.

20-23

Missing

`

.

I will not go on into it. We will cover it later on the floor. I know I speak for what Senator Armstrong thinks and a large group of the members of the House and Senate that really have a basic philosophical difference of what is going on here tonight. I say it with all respect.

I think the Chairman knows the respect I hold for him and 6 for Senator Dole and others. But I think we are really headed 7 8 down the wrong track. It is going to be detrimental to the 9 country. It is going to be detrimental to our ability to 10 govern this country, to have the financial markets maintain 11 stability. And it seems to me like we are following the track of the Brazilian and Argentine model, instead of a model based 12 on a strong, free America that we should be following. 13

So I will be opposing this package.

15 The Chairman. Thank you, Senator.

16 Are there others?

17 | (No response.)

14

18 The Chairman. If not, let's start through this piece of 19 legislation. The first one I would like to speak to is Mr. 20 Kyle. We have some trade legislation. If you would get on to 21 that.

22 Mr. Kyle. Yes, Mr. Chairman. There are two provisions, 23 really, that are trade related. The first relates to the 24 Customs user fee which the Congress modified and passed for 25 another year earlier this year. The Committee package would

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 - LASER BOND

1 extend the Customs user fee through September 30, 1995 and tied to that extension is authority to the administration to 2 3 adjust the fee to make it GATT consist. Other appropriate changes are made. 4 Also, Mr. Chairman, there are provisions making technical 5 corrections to the Customs and Trade Act of 1990. Those are 6 the trade related provisions. 7 The Chairman. Do I hear a motion to approve? 8 9 Senator Moynihan. I so move, Mr. Chairman. 10 The Chairman. All in favor of the motion stated, make it known my saying aye. 11 12 (A chorus of ayes.) The Chairman. Opposed? 13 (No response.) 14 The Chairman. Motion carried. 15 Mr. Humphreys, if you would go ahead with income 16 17 securities. Mr. Humphreys. Yes, Mr. Chairman. 18 There are a number of amendments relating to Social Security and income security 19 provisions. There is an extension of an expiring provision 20 which allows claimants to get benefits during an appeal 21 There is a change in the definition of disability as 22 process. it applies to widows to make it the same as the definition 23 that applies to workers. There are reforms of the procedures 24 25 for selecting and monitoring representatives of payees of

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

26 1 Social Security recipients. There is a provision streamlining the process for approving attorney's fees and there is a 2 provision which pays for these and the other income security 3 changes which modifies the requirements for claiming benefits 4 on a retroactive basis. 5 And then there are several other minor and technical 6 7 provisions relating to the Social Security and welfare 8 programs. 9 The Chairman. Are there questions? 10 (No response.) 11 Senator Dole. I move we approve this section. The Chairman. A motion has been made. All in favor of 12 the motion stated make it known by saying aye. 13 14 (A chorus of ayes.) 15 The Chairman. Opposed? 16 (No response.) 17 The Chairman. Motion carried. Thank you. 18 Ms. Malone, if you would go ahead on the section of child 19 care. Ms. Malone. Mr. Chairman, the child care provisions 20 include the October 4th Committee offer to Ways and Means, 21 22 refundable tax credits which include the family size adjustment of the EITC, the child health insurance credit and 23 24 the refundable dependent care credit, and child care 25 provisions under the Labor and Human Resources Committee MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO. BAYONNE. N J 07002 · LASER BOND

without prejudice to any discussions there may be with the 1 White House. 2 The Chairman. 3 May I have a motion? 4 Senator Moynihan. I move the adoption, sir. The Chairman. All in favor of the motion stated make it 5 known by stating aye. 6 7 (A chorus of ayes.) The Chairman. 8 Opposed? 9 (No response.) 10 The Chairman. Motion carried. Thank you. 11 Dr. Weiss, if you would make your presentation. 12 Dr. Weiss. Yes, Mr. Chairman. The Medicare deficit reduction provisions include \$34.044 billion over five years 13 in reductions in reimbursement to providers; \$17.645 billion 14 15 over a period of five years in additional cost sharing for 16 Medicare beneficiaries; \$2.8 billion in Medicare deficit 17 reduction; other outlay reductions totaling \$2.9 billion for a 18 gross deficit reduction total in the mandatory and outlay 19 category of \$58.1 billion over the five year period. In addition, there are approximately \$5.4 billion worth of 20 spending initiatives which include closure of the urban/rural 21 gap between payment rates for hospitals, an increase in fees 22 23 for certified registered nursed anesthetists, living wills, a series of items in the Medicaid category with the near poor 24 elderly to ease the burden of the additional cost sharing, a 25

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO , BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 · LASER BOND

28 series of items in a child health package relating to improved 1 Medicaid coverage for young children and children up to the 2 age of nineteen, a series of technical and minor adjustments 3 in the Nursing Home Reform Bill adopted by this Committee and 4 enacted in 1987, and two small initiatives in the area of home 5 and community-based care for the mentally retarded, 6 7 developmentally disabled, and frail elderly. 8 The Chairman. Are there questions? 9 (No response.) The Chairman. If not --10 Senator Moynihan. I move the adoption of the section. 11 12 The Chairman. All in favor of the section being adopted 13 make it known by saying aye. (A chorus of ayes.) 14 15 The Chairman. **Opposed?** 16 (No response.) The Chairman. Motion carried. 17 Mr. Sessions? 18 Mr. Sessions. Mr. Chairman, the revenue component of the 19 package includes a number of expiring provisions -- would 20 21 extend a number of expiring provisions of current law. It would include a package of energy incentives. 22 It would include a modification to the estate freeze rules. 23 It would 24 include a provision to provide a credit for expenditures that 25 facilitate access of disabled persons to public facilities, in

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 . LASER BOND

combination with a proposal to lower the current law provision
 that allows expensing of similar amounts.

It would include an increase in the earned income tax 3 credit and an additional amount of tax relief provided to low 4 5 income individuals provided through a similar proposal. It 6 would include a limitation on itemized deductions, an increase 7 in the motor fuels tax by a total of 9.5 cents phased in over several years, an increase in the tobacco excise taxes by an 8 amount equivalent to 8 cents per pack of cigarettes, also 9 phased in over the period. 10

It would include increases in the current alcohol taxes, a 11 10 percent luxury excise tax. A number of smaller items, 12 13 including the expansion of the current excise tax that applies 14 to ozone depleting chemicals, an extension of the leaking 15 underground storage trust fund excise tax, an increase in the airport trust fund aviation excise taxes, an increase in the 16 harbour maintenance excise tax, a provision that would change 17 the treatment of loss deduction and salvage values for 18 insurance companies, a provision relating to the amortization 19 of deferred acquisition expenses of insurance companies, 20 certain tax compliance provisions related to bills -- H.R. 21 4308 and S.2410 -- a provision relating to withdrawals from 22 23 overfunded pension plans to fund retiree health expenses, and a related provision dealing with withdrawals from overfunded 24 25 pension plans, a provision relating to the disallowance of

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

1 interest on corporate tax deficiencies, a number of provisions that would deal with various corporate loop holes or other 2 business tax loop holes, an extension of certain IRS user 3 fees, an extension of the Medicare tax to all State and local 4 employees, an extension of the Social Security taxes to State 5 and local employees not participating in a public employee 6 7 retirement system, an extension of the FUTA surtax, an increase in railroad retirement payroll taxes, modification of 8 9 the payroll tax deposit rules, an extension of the telephone 10 excise tax, and an increase in the Medicare tax wage cap to \$89,000. 11 In addition, there would be a proposal to increase the 12 refund review threshold of the Joint Tax Committee. 13 The Chairman. Thank you. 14 15 May I have a motion on the approval of this section. Senator Packwood. 16 So moved. 17 The Chairman. All in favor of that motion make it known 18 by saying aye. 19 (A chorus of ayes.) 20 The Chairman. Now let me say before the final vote that we will also have a Czechoslovakian Trade Agreement yet 21 tonight which will take a very short period of time. 22 So I do 23 not want the members to all cut out on me here. 24 You had something, Mr. Humphreys. 25 Mr. Humphreys. Yes, Mr. Chairman. I need to point out

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

30

.

31 that the budget resolution also instructs the Committee to 1 include a debt limit change in the Reconciliation Bill. 2 3 The Chairman. May we have approval of that? Senator Moynihan. I so move. 4 The Chairman. Give us the date on that. 5 Mr. Humphreys. It's a five-year -- It's a dollar 6 extension that is estimated to go for five years. It is \$1.9 7 trillion. 8 9 Senator Dole. \$1.9 what? 10 Mr. Humphreys. \$1.9 trillion. Senator Dole. Trillion? 11 12 Mr. Humphreys. Trillion. The Chairman. That's the estimate. 13 Senator Dole. I think that may be contentious. 14 I quess it was part of the agreement, sort of the budget process 15 agreement. But I know we have a couple of very stiff 16 17 opposition to that provision if it is over a trillion dollars. 18 Does it have to approved in this package? Mr. Humphreys. The budget directive in the resolution, I 19 believe, says that we are directed to include a debt limit 20 increase of up to \$1.9 trillion in the Reconciliation Bill. 21 Senator Breaux. Up to or anything less than? 22 23 Senate Committee on Finance shall report changes in law within 24 its jurisdiction which provide for an increase in the 25 MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N J 0/002 · LASER BOND

1 permanent statutory limit on the public debt by an amount not 2 to exceed \$1,900,000,000.

3 | Senator Heinz. Mr. Chairman?

The Chairman. Yes.

4

Senator Heinz. Mr. Chairman, what I am about to say 5 relates to the point. First, I would like to point out to 6 7 those who are interested that this legislation not only includes all the changes in law that have just been voted on, 8 but it contains a recommendation to the Budget Committee that 9 the Finance Committee -- and I do not recall anybody voting 10 11 against it, so I think it is fair to say it was adopted without any disagreement, perhaps unanimously -- to include 12 their Gramm-Rudman scoring, in the targets, in the base line, 13 all of Social Security, not just the revenues, not just the 14 expenditures. Not just part of the revenues, I should say, 15 but all the revenues, including interest that is earned on the 16 money that is lent by the Social Security system to the 17 Federal Government. 18

19 Right now the budget agreement only contains part of the 20 truth, part of the revenues. And many of us feel very 21 strongly that if we are going to truly safeguard the Social 22 Security system, all of the revenues and all of the 23 expenditures should be out of the budget deficit accounting 24 process, out of Gramm-Rudman-Hollings, out of the targets, and 25 out of reconciliation.

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

And unless this proposal is acted upon favorably by the Budget Committee or is acted upon in the case of a floor amendment, I think there will be a number of us who will have trouble supporting the final package.

5 One other comment related to that is that there are burdens, real burdens, in this package. I think they have 6 been fairly distributed but they are still burdens. 7 It is terribly important that we do what we say we are going to do 8 on follow through if some people get off the hook -- if the 9 10 wealthy get off the hook or if big corporations get off the hook or certain special interests get off the hook or certain 11 regions get off the hook -- we will not have distributed those 12 burdens fairly. 13

So enforcement is a very real issue with most of the
people on this Committee. Senator Packwood said it very
clearly and very well. That is critically important.

I have one last point and it is this: That John Chafee 17 referred to the fact that this, even if we passed this half a 18 trillion dollar budget deficit reduction package that we would 19 20 still during the five-year period accumulate in excess of a half a trillion dollars additional deficit. He is right, but 21 the number is closer to three-quarters of a trillion dollars 22 in deficit, and that is still cheating to the tune of \$170 23 billion by pretending that that revenue which properly belongs 24 in the Social Security system is somehow general revenues, 25

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 - LASER BOND

1 | which it is not.

2 Therefore, we are faced with somewhere between a threequarters of a trillion and a one trillion dollar deficit. 3 Hence this exorbitant increase in the national debt. 4 We o 5 should recognize that as unpleasant as the work that we have had to do leading up to this point is that it represents 6 7 something less than a halfway measure if we are going to leave to our children anything approaching a balanced budget and a 8 posterity in terms of a national debt that will be anywhere 9 near a burden that they can, let alone should, be able to 10 11 bear. 12 The Chairman. Thank you. Are there other comments? 13 Senator Bradley. Mr. Chairman? 14 The Chairman. Yes. 15 Senator Bradley. 16 Senator Bradley. Mr. Chairman, I want to thank you for your unfailing courtesy. I am sorry that I will not be able 17 to go along with you. I think it is wrong to raise taxes on 18 middle income families at the same time that we are creating 19 new tax breaks for wealth oil and energy investors. 20 I think it is unfair to ask senior citizens to pin it on Medicare to 21 22 bear an unreasonable portion of the cost of the deficit reduction package. 23 So I will vote no. 24 25 Senator Durenberger. Mr. Chairman?

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N J 07002 . LASER BOND

1

The Chairman. Senator Durenberger?

Senator Durenberger. Mr. Chairman, I am going to vote
with you again this year and I am going to quote my leader,
Bob Dole, to the affect that our choices are, do we do nothing
or do we do the best that we can. And I am going to add to
that, under the circumstances.

7 Jack Danforth said the Medicare budget alone is going to 8 increase from \$92 billion to \$150 billion over the next five 9 years. We have 63 million Americans who go for some part of 10 this year without access to health insurance. I can go on and 11 on with the realities that we all know about the cost of 12 health care in this country and access to health care. So 13 while I compliment my leadership, I must say that this has 14 been a difficult year for followers.

15 We did not have to do the work. This Committee did not 16 meet that often. We did not have to go to Andrews Air Force 17 Base. But once again we were faced with doing the best we 18 could under the circumstances. And those of us who would like 19 to get a handle on access to health care for everybody in this 20 country, and who would like to get a handle on the cost of 21 health care and a lot of other things, we are faced simply 22 with a set of choices that relate to a deficit.

All I can do, Mr. Chairman, is hope that next year isgoing to be different.

The Chairman. I hope so.

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N.J. 07002 - LASER (

25

Senator Durenberger. And that the people on this
 Committee who have over the time I have been here have
 demonstrated a tremendous skill at dealing with the policy
 issues that face this country.

Somehow or other by next year we will be able to apply 5 6 those skills to some of the problems this country faces. I do 7 not think any of us have enjoyed this year. We certainly have not enjoyed the last week or two. This Committee is a 8 9 Committee of tremendous opportunity. It has the best 10 leadership and the best staff in this Congress. I just hope and pray that after we get over this very rough hurdle over 11 12 which you and George, the two Bobs have led us, that maybe 13 with the help of the rest of the leadership in this Town, that 14 somehow or other next year is going to be different.

15 The Chairman. Thank you, Senator. Any further comments?16 Senator Armstrong. Mr. Chairman?

17 | The Chairman. Senator Armstrong?

Senator Armstrong. Mr. Chairman, I have one question and
then perhaps a brief comment. Have you announced what the
schedule will be for filing views on the bill?

The Chairman. No, I have not. They tell me that they hope to get, by working over the weekend, that the staff will be able to get the language to the Budget Committee by Monday. Senator Armstrong. If we have our views in by Monday morning?

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 - LASER BOND

The Chairman. That would be fine.

2 Senator Armstrong. Mr. Chairman, if we have the
3 opportunity then to file views I will make my comments very
4 short.

5 Every once in awhile every one of us makes a dreadful mistake. Every once in awhile even the Senate Finance 6 7 Committee makes a dreadful mistake. I think history is going to record that this is probably the worst mistake I have ever 8 seen the Finance Committee make. I feel just like David 9 10 Durenberger does, that this is the best Committee of Congress, the most astute, the most thoughtful, with only a few 11 12 occasional lapses, the most congenial, and the most bipartisan. 13

But, Mr. Chairman, I am convinced this is really dumb. 14 Ι 15 have not talked to anybody among the professional economists 16 who look at things that think it is smart to raise taxes on the brink of a recession. In fact, we are really not on the 17 18 brink of a recession, we are in a recession. There is some 19 dispute among economists of whether or not this is going to be a mild recession that might last one or two quarters or 20 whether or not we are really heading into something that is 21 22 much worse than that. I do not know the answer.

I do know that the real estate market is in dreadful shape
all over the country -- in Colorado, in Texas, and elsewhere.
The stock market has crashed. It is down 600 points in the

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

1

last few weeks. The bond market is sagging badly. There are
 some -- Well I don't need to recite the data. Every Senator
 knows it.

To raise taxes at that particular moment in the life of our economy not only suggests insensitivity to the future economic growth of the country, but is likely in my view to be self-defeating. It is actually likely to produce less revenue rather than more.

So I think it is a mistake. I am buoyed up by a thought 9 10 which Jim Miller suggested last night or this morning, that we 11 do not have to trade anything to get a capital gains tax cut 12 because by January or February it will be obvious to everybody that the economy is in a full blown recession and in that 13 14 setting Congress will stampede the pass of capital gains tax 15 cut. Later than it should perhaps, but my hunch is that is exactly what will happen. I am sorry I will not be a member 16 17 of the Committee when it does.

18 In the meantime, for the reasons I have just stated, I
19 will vote no.

20 The Chairman. Thank you, Senator.

21 Are there other comments?

22 Senator Boren. Mr. Chairman?

23 The Chairman. Yes. Senator Boren?

24 Senator Boren. Mr. Chairman, I want to join the others in 25 commending you for your responsible leadership. Just

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

listening to my colleague from Colorado, I share his deep 1 concern about the economy and the direction the country is 2 taking in terms of the economic strength of this country. 3 I have to come to a different conclusion than he, however, 4 with all due respect, as to what that should lead us to do 5 tonight. I believe for us to remain in gridlock, for us to 6 show an inability after being challenged by the President and 7 the Leaders of both parties, that to reach some kind of 8 agreement to deal with the deficit crisis which faces us could 9 well be the final blow to the fragile level of confidence that 10 11 remains in our national economy.

I think for us to fail to act to deal with this problem 12 that we face would be to play Russian roulette with the 13 14 American economy. I simply do not think it would be 15 responsible for us to do so. So I think while many of us have misgivings about part of this package, the only responsible 16 thing for us to do is to accept this compromise, as George 17 18 Mitchell has called it, and to try to move forward on reducing the deficit which really cripples the economic future and 19 well-being of the country. 20

I had hoped that we could have adopted your original plan, Mr. Chairman. Because it address two great needs of the country that I think really are twin responsibilities and tonight I believe we are only meeting one. One is to try to reduce the deficit. The other is to try to rebuild the

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

economic strength of the country and make us more competitive
 and more productive so that we can regain a share of our world
 markets.

4 And as we look ahead to the next century we realize that 5 it is not on our military strength, but it is on our economic strength that the leadership possibilities of this country are 6 7 going to rest. I happen to believe that if we could have had 8 the trade off between bringing tax fairness to the Code by doing away with the so-called bubble, by doing away with an 9 indefensible situation in which those that make \$80,000 a year 10 11 are charged at a marginal tax rate of 33 percent while those 12 over \$200,000 are charged at a marginal tax rate of 28 percent; and if we could have coupled that action with a 13 14 reasonable capital gains proposal, and perhaps another series of incentives to encourage saving and investment in this 15 16 country, I think it would have been a much better package. 17 We have to start thinking in this Committee about Tax Codes in other countries. We have to start thinking about the 18 cost of capital at the margin in this country compared to the 19 20 cost of capital elsewhere. We have to start thinking about

21 how they treat certain kinds of economic activities in terms 22 of the tax burden compared to how we do.

I understood that when I was a Governor. I can assure you I didn't think about changes in tax policy in Oklahoma without knowing about taxes in Texas or Colorado or New Mexico. We

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO. BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

1 are in a global economy and we had better start thinking about 2 our comparative tax burdens in this country, the way we tax 3 certain elements of income compared to the way they are taxed 4 in other countries.

5 So I think that we have measured up rather well to the 6 first responsibility of doing something about the deficit. I 7 do not think we have yet begun to come to grips with our 8 second responsibility of doing something to rebuild the 9 economic competitiveness of this country and to use the Tax 10 Code as an instrument of economic policy related to what we 11 need to do to increase saving and investment in this country.

I am also disappointed because I think cutting the capital gains rate at this point, as Senator Armstrong has said, would have helped stimulate the economy and would have helped stimulate economic growth at a time in which the economy is headed into a downturn.

17 So I think it has been a missed opportunity. But, Mr. 18 Chairman, it certainly has not been your fault. You offered a 19 very reasonable package, one that I think the vast majority of 20 the American people would have applauded, a package that would 21 have traded off that unfair tax bubble and would have also 22 allowed us to adopt some real incentives for economic growth 23 at the same time.

I think that is what should have happened. Senator Nunn, and I, and others are still working on a package that we hope

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

might still come to fruition, perhaps as we consider this
 matter on the Senate floor, and it might be possible.

But as for tonight, that is not possible. We have to 3 forge a bi-partisan agreement. You have led us to the best 4 5 possible bi-partisan agreement -- one that reduces the gasoline tax, the regressive nature of it; one who hits 6 Medicare a little less; one which makes the Tax Code somewhat 7 more progressive, with some other important incentives for 8 small business. And in that area there are some real 9 10 incentives for small business growth.

So I commend you for your leadership. My only hope is, as other members of the Committee have expressed, that we will come back to visit our other responsibility of really using tax policy as an instrument for economic competitiveness in this country and not just having to act in emergency situations as we face tonight.

The Chairman. Thank you very much, Senator.

I think what you are going to see here is serious,
credible cut in that deficit. That is what we have to do if
we are going to get this country moving again and get interest
rates down.

I would like to now call for a roll call vote and a motionon it.

Dr. Weiss. Mr. Chairman, before you vote, if the staff could ask for the usual authority to make necessary minor and

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

42

1	technical adjustments to achieve the targets.
2	The Chairman. Without objection that will be done.
3	May I have a motion for a roll call vote?
4	Senator Moynihan. I so move.
5	The Chairman. All right.
6	Will the Secretary call the roll.
7	The Clerk. Mr. Moynihan.
8	Senator Moynihan. Aye.
9	The Clerk. Mr. Baucus.
10	Senator Baucus. No.
11	The Clerk. Mr. Boren.
12	Senator Boren. Aye.
13	The Clerk. Mr. Bradley.
14	Senator Bradley. No.
15	The Clerk. Mr. Mitchell.
16	Senator Mitchell. Aye.
17	The Clerk. Mr. Pryor.
18	Senator Pryor. Aye.
19	The Clerk. Mr. Riegle.
20	Senator Riegle. Aye.
21	The Clerk. Mr. Rockefeller.
22	Senator Rockefeller. Aye.
23	The Clerk. Mr. Daschle.
24	Senator Daschle. Aye.
25	The Clerk. Mr. Breaux.
	MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

43

MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N J 07002 . LASER BOND

44 1 Senator Breaux. Aye. 2 The Clerk. Mr. Packwood. Senator Packwood. Aye. 3 4 The Clerk. Mr. Dole. 5 Senator Packwood. Aye. 6 The Clerk. Mr. Roth. 7 Senator Armstrong. No. 8 The Clerk. Mr. Danforth. Senator Danforth. Aye. 9 The Clerk. Mr. Chafee. 10 11 Senator Chafee. Aye. The Clerk. Mr. Heinz. 12 Senator Heinz. 13 Aye. The Clerk. Mr. Durenberger. 14 15 Senator Durenberger. Aye. 16 The Clerk. Mr. Armstrong. 17 Senator Armstrong. No. 18 The Clerk. Mr. Symms. 19 Senator Symms. No. 20 The Clerk. Mr. Chairman. 21 The Chairman. Aye. 22 The Clerk. There are 15 Senators in favor, 5 opposed. 23 The Chairman. Good. The Bill is approved. Mr. Kyle, we have the Czechoslovakian Trade Agreement. 24 25 Mr. Kyle. Mr. Chairman, we have before the Committee this MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

45 evening the U.S.-Czechoslovakian Trade Agreement which was 1 2 reached in April by the administration and is before the 3 Committee for approval. The primary feature of that is that it would provide most-favored nation treatment for both 4 5 countries. It also provides easier access for U.S. companies seeking to do business in Czechoslovakia. 6 7 Senator Packwood. I move we report the Treaty. The Chairman. A motion is made to report the Treaty. 8 A11 in favor of the motion stated make it known by saying aye. 9 10 (A chorus of ayes.) The Chairman. Opposed? 11 12 (No response.) 13 The Chairman. The ayes have it. The Treaty is approved. 14 We had a study, did we? 15 Mr. Kyle. That is correct, Mr. Chairman. There is also a 16 Section 332 study to be conducted by the ITC that was first 17 requested by Senator Packwood regarding Canadian apples in the Canadian and U.S. apple markets. 18 19 The Chairman. May I have motion to approve the study? 20 Senator Moynihan. I so move. The Chairman. All in favor make it known by saying aye. 21 22 (A chorus of ayes.) 23 The Chairman. Opposed, no? 24 (No response.) 25 The Chairman. The motion is approved. MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N J 07002 · LASER BOND

		4
1	Gentlemen, we are adjourned. Thank you.	•
2	(Whereupon, the meeting was adjourned at 12:23 a.m.)	
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12	/ /	
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
	MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223	

PENGAD CO, BAYONNE, N J. 07002 . LASER BOND

1

.

	47
1	CERTIFICATE
2	This is to certify that the foregoing proceedings of a an
3	Executive Committee Meeting, Committee on Finance, United
4	States Senate, held on October 12, 1990, were transcribed as
5	herein appears and that this is the original transcript
6	thereof.
7	
8	, nat
9	William J. Wille
10	WILLIAM J. MOFFITT
11	Official Court Reporter
12	
13	My Commission Expires April 14, 1994.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
	MOFFITT REPORTING ASSOCIATES (301) 350-2223
[

PENGAD CO., BAYONNE, N J. 07002 . LASER BOND